



# Minutes

Name of meeting	<b>FULL COUNCIL</b>
Date and time	<b>WEDNESDAY, 21 JULY 2010 COMMENCING AT 6.00 PM</b>
Venue	<b>COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HAL, NEWPORT, ISLE OF WIGHT</b>
Present	Cllrs Ian Stephens (Chairman), Barry Abraham, Jonathan Bacon, Reg Barry, George Brown, Ivan Bulwer, George Cameron, Vanessa Churchman, Dawn Cousins, Rodney Downer, Stuart Dyer, Paul Fuller, Edward Giles, John Hobart, Richard Hollis, John Howe, Heather Humby, Tim Hunter-Henderson, Julie Jones-Evans, Patrick Joyce, David Knowles, Geoff Lumley, Roger Mazillius, David Pugh, Colin Richards, Susan Scoccia, Arthur Taylor, Gary Taylor, Ian Ward, Margaret Webster, Chris Welsford, Jerry White, Wayne Whittle David Whittaker, David Williams, William Wyatt-Millington
Apologies	Cllrs Peter Bingham, Roger Dixcey, Lora Peacey-Wilcox

---

Prior to the commencement of the meeting, a member of the public, Mr Robert Izzard, raised a point of order relating to the legality of the meeting. The Director of Corporate Services indicated it was an issue that Mr Izzard had previously raised at the Cabinet meeting held earlier in the week. She advised that the Council had a requirement to make papers available five clear working days prior to the meeting, which had been done. Occasionally papers were referred to at a meeting that were not part of the agenda because it was not thought they were key papers at the time the agenda was despatched, or they only became available after this date. When that happened it was the Council's practice to make those papers available. Mr Izzard had subsequently been given a copy of the paper that was referred to at the Cabinet meeting.

The Director advised that the Cabinet meeting was lawful and there was nothing to prevent Council making a decision.

**18. Minutes**

**RESOLVED :**

THAT the Minutes of the meeting held on [16 June 2010](#) be confirmed.

**19. Declarations of Interest**

Councillors Paul Fuller, Chris Welsford, Reg Barry and Rodney Downer declared a personal interest in Minute 23 (a) - Budget Review 2010/11 – in relation to the Student Rider Scheme.

Councillor Roger Mazillius declared a personal interest in Minute 23 (a) - Budget Review 2010/11 - as his mother-in-law was in receipt of attendance allowance which was administered by the Council.

Councillors Heather Humby, Reg Barry, George Brown, Dawn Cousins, John Hobart and Margaret Webster declared a personal interest in Minutes 23 (a) - Budget Review 2010/11 – as they all had a bus pass.

## 20. Public Question Time

Questions were put to the Chairman as follows :

<b>Name</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Mr Robert Jackson (Vice Chair of Isle of Wight Youth Council) ( <a href="#">PQ 30/10</a> )	How could the Council justify cutting the Student Rider Scheme which would have a drastic effect on the whole community.	The Cabinet Member indicated he had met with the Youth Council the previous day; the Student Rider was a discretionary scheme which the Council could no longer afford and would therefore be recommending that it be abolished with effect from 1 September 2010. Further discussions were to take place with Southern Vectis on alternatives.
Mr David Miller, Cowes ( <a href="#">PQ 31/10</a> )	A supplementary question relating to a 2,000 signature petition and unanimous support from the Youth Council was raised.	The Cabinet Member advised he was aware of the strength of feeling but the Student Rider as it stood was unsustainable.
Mr Adrian Whittaker of Ryde	As Mr Miller was not in attendance his question was not asked. What advances had been made in the Eco Island strategy and how the carbon footprint had been reduced in the past year.	The Cabinet Member indicated he would provide a written response. The Cabinet Member advised there were a number of things taking place across the Island in support of the Eco-island initiative. The Bio-mass plant proposed for Stag Lane, was to be on Council owned land, it would deliver significant economic and environmental benefits to the Island in the longer term. There were a number of initiatives being undertaken as a local authority. The Cabinet member indicated he would provide a more detailed written response.

<b>Name</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Comment</b>
A Medina High School Student	If the Student rider was to be abolished, some students would not be able to afford to go to school. That would mean parents would have to drop their children off at school which in turn meant increase the carbon footprint.	The Cabinet Member indicated the Council had a arrangements in place for Home to School Transport. There was a duty to provide free Home to School transport for any primary aged children who lived more than 2 miles from their catchment area school. There was also a duty to provide free Home to School transport to children of secondary school age who lived more than 3 miles from the school in their catchment area. A tendering process had recently been completed and arrangements were in place for the autumn. School transport was also provided for children if they happened to live in what was considered an unsafe route to school. Young people who don't have access to free Home to School transport scheme currently have the option of using the Student Rider scheme or the Freedom Passes which would still exist if the Student Rider scheme ceased.
Ben Yates (Chairman of Isle of Wight Youth Council)	Have alterations to the scheme been considered rather than getting rid of it, for example rising the price. Young people would prefer to pay a higher rate for the Student Rider rather than it being abolished. Would rather pay £1.50 per journey rather than having to pay £180.00 straight out. Not many students can afford to pay that in one go.	The Cabinet Member advised that one of the difficulties arising from any variations to the existing scheme was the Local Authority would incur a significant financial risk if that financial commitment was continued. Discussions were to be held with Southern Vectis and a suggestion on the variation of the Freedom Pass could be brought forward. Committed to looking at other methods of supporting young people in terms of Home to School transport.

<b>Name</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Mr Stephen Skipper	The petition on facebook was not acceptable to the Council until December 2010. Will petitions on facebook be taken into consideration?	The Cabinet Member advised he had seen the petitions on line, but they should be taken forward in the prescribed format.
A Medina High School Student	If the Student Rider is abolished some students will have to move to schools in their catchment area which many people did not want to do. If have to go to a school they dislike it could cause truanting.	The Cabinet Member advised there was a national policy which applied, the Council had a duty to provide transport for pupils within their catchment area. If students and their parents decided to go to an out of area school, then it is not the duty of the local authority to fund Home to School transport.

21. **Implementation of Council Procedure Rule 23 (2)**

Due to a disturbance in the public gallery during the previous item the Chairman adjourned the meeting to enable the public gallery to be cleared in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 23 (2).

Upon reconvening :

22. **Chairman's Report**

A written report had been circulated for information.

The Chairman advised he had been in correspondence with the people from Chongqing in south west China and had issued an invitation for them to visit the Isle of Wight.

The Chairman reported that due to ill health Councillor Peter Bingham had resigned his position as Cabinet member for Resources and as Chairman of the Pension Fund Committee.

The Leader indicated he would re-allocate Councillor Bingham's Cabinet responsibilities in relation to resources. The Pension Fund Committee Annual Meeting was due to be held the following week so there would be a need to appoint a Chairman.

The Director of Corporate Services advised that Council was allowed to take urgent items of business without giving five clear days notice. The Chairman therefore asked for nominations for the position of Chairman of the Pension Fund Committee.

Councillor Roger Mazillius was proposed and seconded. There being no further nominations it was :

**RESOLVED :**

THAT Councillor Roger Mazillius be appointed Chairman of the Pension Fund Committee for the ensuing year.

**23. Petition**

The Chairman advised members that prior to the start of the meeting he had met with members of the Isle of Wight Youth Council who had presented him with a petition in relation to the Student Rider Scheme.

Councillor David Pugh, Leader of the Council, received the petition.

**24. Motion Submitted under Procedure Rule 10**

In accordance with Procedure Rule 10, the following motion was moved by Councillor Geoff Lumley:

That Council notes:

- That the increase in VAT from 17.5% to 20% announced in the Government's June Budget will fall hardest on those least able to afford it.
- That the increase in VAT will lead to higher prices for goods and services, will have a disproportionate impact on pensioners and other low income groups; and will have a severe impact on businesses, charities and community groups on the Isle of Wight.
- That the effect of the increase in VAT, when taken with other measures in the Budget, will be unfair to pensioners, who have not had a compensatory increase in other benefits and allowances.
- That the way the VAT increase will affect pensioners and other low income groups runs counter to the Government's Coalition Agreement statement on 20 May 2010 that it would "ensure that fairness is at the heart of those decisions so that all those most in need are protected."
- That the Institute of Fiscal Studies has stated the VAT increase was not "unavoidable," as the Chancellor of the Exchequer said in his Budget speech.

That Council resolves:

To write directly to the Chancellor of the Exchequer raising concerns about the impact of the proposed VAT increase on pensioners, other vulnerable groups and businesses on the Isle of Wight.

Following debate the motion was put to the vote and it was lost.

25. **Fire and Rescue Service Annual Report**

The Cabinet Member for Fire and Community Safety reported on the Fire and Rescue Service Annual report.

Members were reminded how the Island had been one of the two lowest performing Fire Services in the country but that since then there had been significant changes and the service was now much improved. The report set out a clear process of where the Fire Service was now and how it had moved forward. He thanked the Chief Fire Officer for all the work that had been done.

RESOLVED :

THAT the report be noted.

26. **Suspension of Council Procedure Rule 14(4)**

A proposal to suspend Council Procedure Rule 14(4) was proposed and seconded, which would remove the time limit on speeches from Group Leaders. Following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

THAT Procedure Rule 14(4) be partially suspended for the duration of the following item of business to increase the time limit on speeches from Group leaders (or their nominees) from 10 minutes to up to 20 minutes.

27. **Cabinet**

**Recommendations from the Cabinet**

Council had received a copy of the report which had been submitted to and agreed by Cabinet on 13 July 2010. A copy of the revised recommendations arising from that meeting was circulated to all members prior to the meeting.

The following actions and savings proposals, as set out in Appendix 5, were recommended to Full Council:

- a) That officers fully implement the mechanisms to drive cost savings, as set out in section 1, and for a report on progress to be received at the Budget Review in September.
- b) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Community Services Directorate, as set out in section 2, and the following actions are agreed:
  - (i) Charging for day care, a review of the current approach to free personal homecare, increasing the price of meals on wheels and reviewing the eligibility criteria for services are all investigated, so that they can be fully considered as part of the Budget Review in September.

- c) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Children and Young People Directorate, as set out in section 3, and the following actions are agreed:
- (i) The in-year reductions in government funding are implemented with immediate effect, minimising any additional costs being incurred by the council;
  - (ii) General budget management takes place to contain spend and reprioritise resources of £761,000;
  - (iii) Arrangements for post-16 transport are reviewed so that consultation can begin in September, and that further information is made available for consideration as part of the Budget Review in September.
- d) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Economy and Environment Directorate, as set out in section 4, and the following actions are agreed:
- (i) The in-year reductions in government funding are implemented with immediate effect, minimising any additional costs being incurred by the council;
  - (ii) The 2010-11 budget for bus subsidies is reduced by £60,000;
  - (iii) The Student Rider scheme is terminated with effect from 1<sup>st</sup> September 2010;
  - (iv) A review of parking income and car parking arrangements is undertaken in advance of the Budget Review in September;
  - (v) Partnering arrangements for fire control are considered ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- f) That the further savings proposed, as set out in section 5, are agreed in principle, subject to detailed work taking place ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- g) That work is undertaken in relation to all the areas for budget review, as set out in section 6, ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- h) That work is undertaken in relation to all the areas identified for more radical change, as set out in section 7, in preparation for the 2011/12 budget.

(During the Leaders speech it was necessary that Procedure Rule 14(4) be further partially suspended for the duration of the item of business to further increase the time limit on speeches from Group leaders (or their nominees) by an additional 10 minutes to up to 30 minutes).

During the debate the following amendment was moved by Cllr Pugh and seconded :

“That paragraph (d)(iii) above be amended to read:

The Student Rider scheme is terminated with effect from 1 September 2010. However, taking into account the issues raised within the Equality Impact Assessment, and the representations made by members of the Isle of Wight Youth Council, that further work is done with Southern Vectis to explore options for introducing variations to their concessions for young people, with a focus on the needs of young people in relation to home-to-school transport. Should any member-level decisions be required on this before September Full Council, that a Cabinet delegated decision is made by the Leader, following consultation with members.

After debate on the amendment it was

RESOLVED :

THAT the amendment as set out above be approved.

A further amendment was proposed by Councillor Bacon and seconded by Councillor Howe as follows :

“That paragraph (d)(iii) above be amended to read:

Taking into account the issues raised within the Equality Impact Assessment, and the representations made by members of the Isle of Wight Youth Council, that further work is done with Southern Vectis to explore options for introducing variations to their concessions for young people, with a focus on the needs of young people in relation to bus transport.

Before voting on this amendment four members stood in accordance with Procedure Rule 17 (5) and a named vote was taken as follows:

For the amendment (12) :

Cllrs Bacon, Barry, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Howe, Humby, Joyce, Knowles, Lumley, Welsford

Against the amendment (20) :

Cllrs Abraham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Giles, Hobart, Hollis, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Pugh, Scoccia, A Taylor, G Taylor, Ward, White, Whittaker, Williams, Wyatt-Williams

The amendment was lost.

Following further debate the substantive motion as follows was put to the vote:

- a) That officers fully implement the mechanisms to drive cost savings, as set out in section 1, and for a report on progress to be received at the Budget Review in September.
- b) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Community Services Directorate, as set out in section 2, and the following actions are agreed:
  - (i) Charging for day care, a review of the current approach to free personal homecare, increasing the price of meals on wheels and reviewing the eligibility criteria for services are all investigated, so that they can be fully considered as part of the Budget Review in September.
- c) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Children and Young People Directorate, as set out in section 3, and the following actions are agreed:
  - (i) The in-year reductions in government funding are implemented with immediate effect, minimising any additional costs being incurred by the council;
  - (ii) General budget management takes place to contain spend and reprioritise resources of £761,000;
  - (iii) Arrangements for post-16 transport are reviewed so that consultation can begin in September, and that further information is made available for consideration as part of the Budget Review in September.
- d) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Economy and Environment Directorate, as set out in section 4, and the following actions are agreed:
  - (i) The in-year reductions in government funding are implemented with immediate effect, minimising any additional costs being incurred by the council;
  - (ii) The 2010-11 budget for bus subsidies is reduced by £60,000;
  - (iii) The Student Rider scheme is terminated with effect from 1 September 2010. However, taking into account the issues raised within the Equality Impact Assessment, and the representations made by members of the Isle of Wight Youth Council, that further work is done with Southern Vectis to explore options for introducing variations to their concessions for young people, with a focus on the needs of young people in relation to home-to-school transport. Should any member-level decisions be required on this before September Full Council, that a Cabinet delegated decision is made by the Leader, following consultation with members.

- (iv) A review of parking income and car parking arrangements is undertaken in advance of the Budget Review in September;
- (v) Partnering arrangements for fire control are considered ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- f) That the further savings proposed, as set out in section 5, are agreed in principle, subject to detailed work taking place ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- g) That work is undertaken in relation to all the areas for budget review, as set out in section 6, ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- h) That work is undertaken in relation to all the areas identified for more radical change, as set out in section 7, in preparation for the 2011/12 budget.

Before voting on this amendment four members stood in accordance with Procedure Rule 17 (5) and a named vote was taken as follows

For (20) :

Cllrs Abraham, Brown, Bulwer, Cameron, Cousins, Giles, Hobart, Hollis, Hunter-Henderson, Jones-Evans, Mazillius, Pugh, Scoccia, A Taylor, G Taylor, Ward, White, Whittaker, Williams, Wyatt-Millington

Against (11) :

Cllrs Bacon, Barry, Churchman, Downer, Dyer, Fuller, Howe, Humby, Joyce, Lumley, Welsford

RESOLVED :

- a) That officers fully implement the mechanisms to drive cost savings, as set out in section 1, and for a report on progress to be received at the Budget Review in September.
- b) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Community Services Directorate, as set out in section 2, and the following actions are agreed:
  - (i) Charging for day care, a review of the current approach to free personal homecare, increasing the price of meals on wheels and reviewing the eligibility criteria for services are all investigated, so that they can be fully considered as part of the Budget Review in September.
- c) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Children and Young People Directorate, as set out in section 3, and the following actions are agreed:

- (i) The in-year reductions in government funding are implemented with immediate effect, minimising any additional costs being incurred by the council;
  - (ii) General budget management takes place to contain spend and reprioritise resources of £761,000;
  - (iii) Arrangements for post-16 transport are reviewed so that consultation can begin in September, and that further information is made available for consideration as part of the Budget Review in September.
- d) That officers are required to address budget pressures within the Economy and Environment Directorate, as set out in section 4, and the following actions are agreed:
- (i) The in-year reductions in government funding are implemented with immediate effect, minimising any additional costs being incurred by the council;
  - (ii) The 2010-11 budget for bus subsidies is reduced by £60,000;
  - (iii) The Student Rider scheme is terminated with effect from 1 September 2010. However, taking into account the issues raised within the Equality Impact Assessment, and the representations made by members of the Isle of Wight Youth Council, that further work is done with Southern Vectis to explore options for introducing variations to their concessions for young people, with a focus on the needs of young people in relation to home-to-school transport. Should any member-level decisions be required on this before September Full Council, that a Cabinet delegated decision is made by the Leader, following consultation with members.
  - (iv) A review of parking income and car parking arrangements is undertaken in advance of the Budget Review in September;
  - (v) Partnering arrangements for fire control are considered ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- f) That the further savings proposed, as set out in section 5, are agreed in principle, subject to detailed work taking place ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- g) That work is undertaken in relation to all the areas for budget review, as set out in section 6, ahead of the Budget Review in September.
- h) That work is undertaken in relation to all the areas identified for more radical change, as set out in section 7, in preparation for the 2011/12 budget.

28. **Suspension of Council Procedure Rule 26**

The Chairman drew Council's attention to the time and proposed an extension to the meeting of up to one hour. The proposal was seconded and following the vote it was

RESOLVED:

THAT the meeting be extended for up to one hour.

29. **Reports of the Cabinet Members**

(i) [The Leader and Cabinet Member for Governance and School Improvement](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

(ii) [The Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for the Economy, Tourism, Leisure and Planning](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

(iii) [Cabinet Member for Adult Social Care and Housing](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

(iv) [Cabinet Member for Children's Services](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

(v) [Cabinet Member for the Environment and Transport](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

A written question was put as follows :

<b>Name</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Councillor Bacon ( <u><a href="#">MQ 18/10</a></u> )	What is the number and/or percentage of refuse collections which were actually made 'back door' rather than kerb-side and the cost of 'assisted' (back-door) collections. What was the number and cost of assisted collections anticipated and budgeted for in this financial year	The Cabinet Member advised there was an allowance for assisted collections, at no cost, of up to 2% of the total number of domestic properties on the Island. Once the 2% threshold was exceeded, a sliding scale of charges came into being and this was taken into account as part of the £100,000 saving that would be delivered by moving to a kerbside collection

<b>Name</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Comment</b>
		service. There were currently 1,657 approved assisted collections which exceeded the 2% threshold and which would have an annual cost of approximately £4,000.

An oral question was put as follows :

<b>Name</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Councillor Welsford	Was the closure of the incineration plant on Forest Road due to the failure of a dioxins and emissions test?	The Cabinet Member advised the plant was to be brought back into use during August 2010.

(vi) [\*\*Cabinet Member for Fire and Community Safety\*\*](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

(vii) [\*\*Cabinet Member for Major Projects, Performance and Communications\*\*](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

(viii) [\*\*Cabinet Member for Resources\*\*](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

(ix) [\*\*Chair of Overview and Scrutiny Committee\*\*](#)

A written report had been circulated for information.

CHAIRMAN